



Correction: Non-Self-Adjoint Toeplitz Matrices Whose Principal Submatrices Have Real Spectrum

Boris Shapiro¹ · František Štampach¹

© The Author(s) 2023

Abstract

We announce an error in the proof of Theorem 8 of *Constr. Approx.* **48**(2) (2019) 191–226.

Correction to:

Constr Approx (2019) 49:191–226

<https://doi.org/10.1007/s00365-017-9408-0>

In [3, Eq. (7)], the false equality

$$\langle u, T_n(\bar{a})u \rangle = \langle f_u, \bar{a} f_u \rangle_\gamma$$

has been used in the course of the proof of Theorem 8. If the terms are interpreted using the notation from [3], the right-hand side equals the integral

$$\frac{1}{2\pi i} \int_{-\pi}^{\pi} \overline{a(\gamma(t))} f_u(\gamma(t)) \overline{f_u(\gamma^*(t))} \frac{\dot{\gamma}(t)}{\gamma(t)} dt,$$

while the left-hand side coincides with $\langle u, T_n^*(a)u \rangle$ and can be expressed as the integral

$$\frac{1}{2\pi i} \int_{-\pi}^{\pi} \overline{a(\gamma^*(t))} f_u(\gamma(t)) \overline{f_u(\gamma^*(t))} \frac{\dot{\gamma}(t)}{\gamma(t)} dt.$$

The two integrals do not coincide in general. Unfortunately, this error is an essential problem for the idea of the proof of Theorem 8, that was based on a contour integral

The original article can be found online at <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00365-017-9408-0>.

✉ František Štampach
stampach@math.su.se

Boris Shapiro
shapiro@math.su.se

¹ Department of Mathematics, Stockholm University, Kräftriket 5, 106 91 Stockholm, Sweden

representation of the quadratic form of a Toeplitz matrix $T_n(a)$, where the integration path is chosen as the Jordan curve γ on which the symbol a is real-valued.

Recall that [3, Thm. 1], which is the main result of the paper, claims that the following 3 statements are equivalent:

- (i) $\Lambda(b) \subset \mathbb{R}$,
- (ii) $b^{-1}(\mathbb{R})$ contains a Jordan curve,
- (iii) $\text{spec}(T_n(b)) \subset \mathbb{R}$ for all $n \in \mathbb{N}$,

where b is a Laurent polynomial, $T_n(b)$ the $n \times n$ Toeplitz matrix given by the symbol b , and $\Lambda(b)$ is the set of limit points of eigenvalues of $T_n(b)$, as $n \rightarrow \infty$; see [3] for details. The logic of the proof of Theorem 1 was to establish implications (i) $\Rightarrow$ (ii) $\Rightarrow$ (iii) $\Rightarrow$ (i). The currently unproven Theorem 8 was used to prove (ii) $\Rightarrow$ (iii). As we are not able to find an alternative proof at the moment, the implication (ii) $\Rightarrow$ (iii) remains unproven.

However, we strongly believe that the currently unproven implication, or at least its weaker form (ii) $\Rightarrow$ (i), is true. The implication (ii) $\Rightarrow$ (iii) is supported by numerous numerical experiments that we have performed. Professors Yi Zhang and Hao-Yan Chen, to whom we are sincerely grateful for noticing the latter error in the proof, expressed a similar opinion.

Recall, by [3, Def. 2], that the Laurent polynomial b is said to belong to the class $\mathcal{R}$, i.e. $b \in \mathcal{R}$, if and only if $\Lambda(b) \subset \mathbb{R}$. We list several places in [3], where arguments based on the claim of [3, Thm. 8] have been used:

- (a) Remark 10.
- (b) Sec. 4.1: Example 1. The symbol $b(z) = z^{-1} + az$, where $a \in \mathbb{C} \setminus \{0\}$, belongs to the class $\mathcal{R}$, if and only if $a > 0$.
- (c) Sec. 4.2: Example 2. The symbol $b(z) = z^{-1} + \alpha z + \beta z^2$, where $\alpha \in \mathbb{C}$ and $\beta \in \mathbb{C} \setminus \{0\}$, belongs to the class $\mathcal{R}$, if and only if $\beta \in \mathbb{R} \setminus \{0\}$ and $\alpha^3 \geq 27\beta^2$.
- (d) Sec. 4.3: Example 3. The symbol $b(z) = z^{-r}(1 + az)^{r+s}$, where $r, s \in \mathbb{N}$ and $a \in \mathbb{R} \setminus \{0\}$, belongs to the class $\mathcal{R}$.
- (e) The second paragraph of Sec. 4.4.

The claim of [3, Rem. 10] was drawn as a direct consequence of Theorem 8 and remains open, too. The other points (b)–(e) comprise concrete examples of symbols, which belong to $\mathcal{R}$ for specific restrictions of the parameters. As the main argument for these claims, we found in [3] an explicit parametrization of the Jordan curve γ , for which $b \circ \gamma$ is real-valued in each of the cases. We will prove at least partly the claims without using Theorem 8.

The equivalence in (b) can be verified directly since the eigenvalues of $T_n(b)$ can be computed fully explicitly

$$\lambda_k = 2(-1)^n \sqrt{a} \cos \frac{\pi k}{n+1}, \quad k = 1, 2, \dots, n,$$

with the standard branch of the square root. This example also exhibits (iii), if $a > 0$.

The point (c) is left conjectural as inessential for the paper in its generality. Its relevant particular case, $b \in \mathcal{R}$ for $\alpha = 3a^2$ and $\beta = a^3$, with $a \in \mathbb{R} \setminus \{0\}$, will be checked as a special case of the point (d) in the end of this corrigendum. Lastly, a

description of a possible construction of further examples of not necessarily banded Toeplitz matrices with real spectra from the point (e) is heavily based on the falsely proven Theorem 8 and also remains open at this point.

As a final correction, we briefly indicate the proof of the implication

$$b(z) = \frac{1}{z^r}(1 + az)^{r+s} \text{ with } r, s \in \mathbb{N} \text{ and } a \in \mathbb{R} \setminus \{0\} \Rightarrow b \in \mathcal{R}.$$

without using the fact that b is real on a Jordan curve. This is the claim (d). In fact, one can prove the stronger claim that the eigenvalues of $T_n(b)$ are all real, for all $n \in \mathbb{N}$, i.e. (iii). The argument relies on the theory of oscillatory matrices [2] and has been used for the special case $r = s = 1$ in the proof of [1, Thm. 2.8]. Without loss of generality, we may assume $a = 1$ since two Toeplitz matrices $T_n(b)$ and $T_n(b_a)$, where $b_a(z) := b(az)$, are similar, if $a \neq 0$. Thus, suppose $b(z) = z^{-r}(1 + z)^{r+s}$. Notice the bidiagonal matrix $T_n(1 + z)$ is totally non-negative, see [2, Def. 4, p. 74]. Since $T_n(b)$ is a submatrix of $T_{n+r+s}^{r+s}(1 + z)$, it is also totally non-negative; see [2, p. 74]. Further, without going into details, let us mention the determinant of $T_n(b)$ can be explicitly computed in terms of binomial coefficients as follows:

$$\det T_n(b) = \prod_{j=0}^{r-1} \binom{n+s+j}{s} / \binom{s+j}{j} = \prod_{j=0}^{r-1} \frac{(n+s+j)!j!}{(n+j)!(s+j)!}.$$

The determinant is obviously non-vanishing and therefore $T_n(b)$ is non-singular. By [2, Thm. 10, p. 100], $T_n(b)$ is oscillatory and hence eigenvalues of $T_n(b)$ are all positive (and simple), see [2, Thm. 6, p. 87].

Acknowledgements The authors are grateful to Professors Yi Zhang and Hao-Yan Chen for pointing out the error.

Open Access This article is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License, which permits use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons licence, and indicate if changes were made. The images or other third party material in this article are included in the article's Creative Commons licence, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the article's Creative Commons licence and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder. To view a copy of this licence, visit <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>.

References

1. Coussement, E., Coussement, J., Van Assche, W.: Asymptotic zero distribution for a class of multiple orthogonal polynomials. *Trans. Am. Math. Soc.* **360**(10), 5571–5588 (2008)
2. Gantmacher, F.P., Krein, M.G.: Oscillation matrices and kernels and small vibrations of mechanical systems, revised ed. AMS Chelsea Publishing, Providence, RI (2002). Translation based on the 1941 Russian original, Edited and with a preface by Alex Eremenko
3. Shapiro, B., Štampach, F.: Non-self-adjoint Toeplitz matrices whose principal submatrices have real spectrum. *Constr. Approx.* **49**(2), 191–226 (2019)

Publisher's Note Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Terms and Conditions

Springer Nature journal content, brought to you courtesy of Springer Nature Customer Service Center GmbH (“Springer Nature”).

Springer Nature supports a reasonable amount of sharing of research papers by authors, subscribers and authorised users (“Users”), for small-scale personal, non-commercial use provided that all copyright, trade and service marks and other proprietary notices are maintained. By accessing, sharing, receiving or otherwise using the Springer Nature journal content you agree to these terms of use (“Terms”). For these purposes, Springer Nature considers academic use (by researchers and students) to be non-commercial.

These Terms are supplementary and will apply in addition to any applicable website terms and conditions, a relevant site licence or a personal subscription. These Terms will prevail over any conflict or ambiguity with regards to the relevant terms, a site licence or a personal subscription (to the extent of the conflict or ambiguity only). For Creative Commons-licensed articles, the terms of the Creative Commons license used will apply.

We collect and use personal data to provide access to the Springer Nature journal content. We may also use these personal data internally within ResearchGate and Springer Nature and as agreed share it, in an anonymised way, for purposes of tracking, analysis and reporting. We will not otherwise disclose your personal data outside the ResearchGate or the Springer Nature group of companies unless we have your permission as detailed in the Privacy Policy.

While Users may use the Springer Nature journal content for small scale, personal non-commercial use, it is important to note that Users may not:

1. use such content for the purpose of providing other users with access on a regular or large scale basis or as a means to circumvent access control;
2. use such content where to do so would be considered a criminal or statutory offence in any jurisdiction, or gives rise to civil liability, or is otherwise unlawful;
3. falsely or misleadingly imply or suggest endorsement, approval, sponsorship, or association unless explicitly agreed to by Springer Nature in writing;
4. use bots or other automated methods to access the content or redirect messages
5. override any security feature or exclusionary protocol; or
6. share the content in order to create substitute for Springer Nature products or services or a systematic database of Springer Nature journal content.

In line with the restriction against commercial use, Springer Nature does not permit the creation of a product or service that creates revenue, royalties, rent or income from our content or its inclusion as part of a paid for service or for other commercial gain. Springer Nature journal content cannot be used for inter-library loans and librarians may not upload Springer Nature journal content on a large scale into their, or any other, institutional repository.

These terms of use are reviewed regularly and may be amended at any time. Springer Nature is not obligated to publish any information or content on this website and may remove it or features or functionality at our sole discretion, at any time with or without notice. Springer Nature may revoke this licence to you at any time and remove access to any copies of the Springer Nature journal content which have been saved.

To the fullest extent permitted by law, Springer Nature makes no warranties, representations or guarantees to Users, either express or implied with respect to the Springer nature journal content and all parties disclaim and waive any implied warranties or warranties imposed by law, including merchantability or fitness for any particular purpose.

Please note that these rights do not automatically extend to content, data or other material published by Springer Nature that may be licensed from third parties.

If you would like to use or distribute our Springer Nature journal content to a wider audience or on a regular basis or in any other manner not expressly permitted by these Terms, please contact Springer Nature at

onlineservice@springernature.com